

Book Reviews

***Jinnah on World Affairs (Selected Documents: 1908-1948)*, edited by Mehrunnisa Ali, Karachi: Pakistan Study Centre, University of Karachi, 2007, pp.728, price Rs. 800**

Since the middle 1980s, a number of mega compilations of Jinnah's speeches, statements, press interviews and writings have been published. Among them mention may be made of Syed Sharifuddin Pirzada's *The Collected Works of Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah* (3 volumes) (1984-86); Waheed Ahmad's *The Nation's Voice* (7 volumes) (1992-2003); Khurshid Ahmad Khan Yusufi's, *Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah: Speeches, Statements and Messages* (4 volumes) (1996); Z. H. Zaidi's [*Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali*] *Jinnah Papers* (17 Volumes) (1993-2004); and Riaz Ahmad's *The Works of Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah* (6 volumes) (1996-2006). The Zaidi and Riaz Ahmad projects remain uncompleted and more volumes concerning the rest of the period to be covered by them are due to be published in due course.

The uniqueness and utility of the present volume are its thematic approach: it concerns Jinnah's specific views on world affairs and politics. In this genre only one book has been published, but it is confined only to the Muslim world: Atique Zafar Sheikh & Riaz Malik (eds.), *Quaid-e-Azam and the Muslim World: Selected Documents 1937-1948* (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 1990). The only other thematic work on Jinnah's documentation genre is a superbly edited work: S. M. Zaman's *Quaid-i-Azam on Education* [Islamabad: NIHCR, 1996]. However, even otherwise, the present work seeks to provide a treasure trove of source material on Jinnah's perspectives on foreign affairs, thereby facilitating researchers to reconstruct the struggle for Pakistan in a wider and more meaningful context. Without going into details, I would refer only to the last item in the compilation: a letter from Jinnah dated Quetta, 1 September 1948 to Beverley Nicholas, the controversial

author of the much acclaimed *Verdict on India* (1944), concerning his proposal to do a book on Pakistan. This Nicholas proposal is also news even to me, although I had gone through Hector Bolitho papers and related material rather thoroughly, which I had retrieved and edited some years ago under the title, *In Quest of Jinnah* (2007).

Based on archival material as well as personal collections in various depositories and the recently published mega compilations, the Mehrunnisa Ali volume includes documents detailing Jinnah's speeches, statements, messages, press conferences, interviews, letters, telegrams, as well as relevant resolutions passed by the AIML under his chairmanship. The documents, totalling 521 and spread over 800 pages, have been arranged chronologically on scientific lines. They cover some 40 years, 1908-48. While the documents for the period 1908-1936 are grouped together the documents pertaining to the 1937-48 period are given yearwise. A breakdown indicates 23 documents for the 1908-36 period, 225 documents for 1937-31 May 1947, and 273 documents for the Pakistan period, beginning June 1947. The number of documents during June 1947-September 1948 indicates how extraordinarily busy Jinnah was during this period, despite being fatally stricken with a terminal disease. And this, above all, not to spare any effort to launch the state he had founded on sure and secure foundations. This, *inter alia*, provides point and force to Richard Symond's (*The Making of Pakistan*, 1950) assertion that 'He had worked himself to death, but had contributed more than any other man to Pakistan's survival' (p. 93). The way Jinnah had acquitted his responsibilities to the minutest detail should serve as a model for the present cavalierish rulers of Pakistan.

The publishers have done well to include a Subject Index besides a General Index, which should serve as a model, at least, for other academic publishers in Pakistan. The way the documents have been compiled systematically bears witness to the imaginative approach, hard work and meticulous research put in by both the editor and the Centre. The work also bristles with high publishing and printing values. The editor contributes a 60 page insightful Introduction, which may provide a number of clues and as well serve as a guide to researchers and students. However an error and an omission may yet be pointed out. Jinnah finally returned to India from London in 1936, not 1937 (p.vi). The omission of Riaz Ahmad's *The Works of Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah* is rather inexplicable since Riaz Ahmad represents the first *complete* volumes of documentation concerning Jinnah, as indicated in the title.

The efforts of both the editor and the publisher call for high commendation, and the Pakistan Study Centre has yet again lived up to

its tradition of presenting works that represent a contribution to the extant body of knowledge on the topic.

Pakistan Study Centre,
University of Karachi,
Karachi.

Sharif al Mujahid

***Quiet Diplomacy: Memoirs of An Ambassador of Pakistan* by Jamsheed Marker, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2010, pp. 448, price Rs.795**

***South American Diaries: a Pakistani Ambassador's Journal* by Raja Tridiv Roy, Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2009, pp. 409, price Rs.660**

I

The writing of memoirs by former officers of the Pakistan diplomatic service is a relatively new and welcome dimension in the area of letters. Not only is history recorded by those who were associated in some way in its making but insights, observations and confidences are provided into the avenues of the overt and covert world of international diplomacy. These can, and should, be made mandatory reading for all would-be diplomats during their training before assumption of their new appointments.

There have appeared, off and on, a few [rather too few] accounts penned by Pakistani diplomats which often include their autobiography – such as *Diary of a Diplomat* by Afzal Iqbal [Lahore, 1966]; *Memoirs of a Pakistani Diplomat* by Mian Ziauddin [Peshawar, 1976]; *Memories and Reflections of a Pakistani Diplomat* by Sultan Muhammad Khan [former foreign secretary; London, 1997]; *Memoirs of a Bystander: a Life in Diplomacy* by Iqbal Akhund [Karachi, 1997]; *Inside the Pakistani Foreign Service: Diplomats and Diplomacy, Story of An Era 1947-87* by Samiullah Koreishi [Islamabad, 2004], and recently *Reminiscences of a Pakistani Diplomat* by Shahid M. Amin [Karachi, 2009]. These are valuable accounts insofar as material in this area is not readily available being guarded zealously by the Official Secrets Act. However, no fear be entertained of its violation as the abovementioned authors have strictly obeyed its strictures. The 30-year rule – whereby classified documents are placed in the public domain – is not applied in Pakistan. This should be implemented so as to trace out the realities of our troubled history and identify those who were responsible.

Mr Jamsheed Marker, famous for his fluent and entertaining cricket commentaries, was directly inducted into the Pakistan Foreign Service where his diverse talents made themselves manifest early. He omits, regretfully, any account of his early life and experiences, for which we have to go – for a partial remedy – to *A Petal from the Rose* [2 vols., Karachi, 1985] by his father Khan Bahadur Kekobad Ardeshir Marker. A person's career is part of one's self and as such one has to complete the picture by making it fully rounded. In the course of his eventful career spanning three decades, Marker was ambassador of Pakistan in three African countries followed by tenures in Eastern Europe, the then former USSR, Canada, Japan, Germany and finally in the USA. Marker entered at the top and left at the top without having to make his way up the slippery ladder. He was already seasoned and suitable for the task he was appointed to. His interaction with people and governments in the different places he was posted is given with a true-to-life accuracy. His difficulties in working with the totalitarian regime in the USSR are unenviable. The phenomenon of why the USSR [a communist, centralist and 'proletarian' society] should be so partial to India [a capitalist, consumerist and exploitative society] is not explained though one can surmise that both are based on a suppression of various ethnic groups composing them while posing as champions of the 'toiling masses'. Initially, Stalin was opposed to the overtures of India regarding it as a 'running dog' of imperialism. Pakistani leaders at the time had not the wisdom to exploit this favourable scenario.

After his retirement, Marker's services were used to advantage by the UN in East Timor and Rwanda. After retirement, Marker has settled in Florida, USA. Certainly, Mr Marker was a devoted diplomat who dedicated his skill and finesse to the service of Pakistan through all the twists and turns of its chaotic history.

The major omission in the book from the reader's viewpoint is that of an assessment and analysis of Pakistani foreign policy over the years that Marker was associated with it, exposing its faults and lapses as well as its successes and achievements. Why has Pakistani diplomacy failed to project its rightful stance on international issues while those who flout international law are treated with general acceptability? If 'war is policy carried out by other means', then certainly those 'other means' have priority over open hostility and full preparation has to be made accordingly. Mr Marker's critique of our foreign policy and its application would have formed an invaluable part of his otherwise lively discourse.

II

Raja Tridiv Roy has been a public figure all his life. His royal role in the Chittagong Hills Tracts and his patriotic character in the 1971 crisis have made him our national hero. His refusal to deal with the Bangladesh and his spurning of Indian efforts to sabotage his loyalty to Pakistan are worthy of utmost admiration. Raja sahib was born for the diplomatic life in which he has played such a distinguished role be it in his various tours or his long and fruitful stint in South America lasting 14 years [being posted to Argentina with concurrent accreditation to four other countries]. The description of these places and of Raja sahib's efforts in building a climate favourable to Pakistan come to the fore in this book which is in diary form with dates but not consecutively. No doubt extraneous material has been excised. The book contains 15 chapters, many pictures and is reinforced by the author's 'photographic' memory. It can be stated with confidence that the Pakistani diplomatic presence in South America was firmly established by Raja Tridiv Roy. Generally, envoys posted to distant countries are not concerned with performing their duties to the full but only in taking advantage of their 'duty-free' perks. Not so Raja Tridiv Roy who attaches little importance to such trivia. His endeavours in diplomatic circles for the powerful presentation of the Pakistani point-of-view makes him a role model for others to emulate. Currently a Federal Minister, Raja Tridiv Roy lives in Islamabad with many memories to cherish and muse on. His two collections of short fiction and his detailed autobiography *The Departed Melody* [Islamabad, 2004] which was reviewed by the present writer in *Pakistan Perspectives* [vol. 9, No. 1, January-June 2004] have proved him a versatile writer in diverse fields.

Certainly, the examples of Jamsheed Marker and Raja Tridiv Roy are worthy of emulation by members of our diplomatic corps and also by those belonging to minority communities. These two gentlemen have contributed greatly to the national weal and identified themselves with the country to which they belong.

Mohammad Ali Jinnah University,
Karachi.

Syed Munir Wasti

Perils, Pitfalls and Reflexivity in Qualitative Research in Education,
edited by Fauzia Shamim and Rashida Qureshi, Karachi: Oxford
University Press, pp.194, price, Rs.395

With the passage of time, as the social science research is becoming

more and more popular and advanced, the intricate problems and dilemmas of conducting research are also increasingly attracting academic focus. The social scientists now are not confined to their objects of research but are also involved in addressing the methodological issues. The present book too falls into the category of works which deal with the issues, confronted by the social science researchers while conducting field researches, particularly in the far-off regions or in the regions other than the ones to which researchers belong or where their tools of research originate from. Based on the compilation of articles, most of which were presented in a multidisciplinary international conference on 'Qualitative Research in Developing Countries: Possibilities and Challenges', held at the University of Karachi, in November 2006, the book is a welcome addition to the literature on research methodology. The articles of the book – almost all being original and also based on field studies – highlight different problems which the respective authors faced while conducting their own researches. Their observations, conclusions and suggestions put together make the present book a good source book for the students of research methodology and particularly for those who are more in the business of applying the research methodology techniques in their researches on regions whose indigenous characteristics may not have been in view while the techniques of research work devised.

Two assumptions serve as the foundation on which the whole edifice of theorization is made in respective chapters. The first is the differentiation between the qualitative and the quantitative research. As explained in his perceptive article, Adrian Holliday suggests that though the underlying aim of both the qualitative and the quantitative research is the same, that is, to make research disciplined and scientific, yet the qualitative research is intensely subjective in nature, wherein the locale, the researcher, and the environment also impact on the results apart from the actual object of research. Moreover, whereas in quantitative research the variables are well in control and can be selected, in qualitative research one is faced with the proliferation of variables. Holliday also suggests that in quantitative research, the researcher has a little and limited impact, while the qualitative research acknowledges and capitalizes on the impact of the researcher. This formulation serves as a foundational assumption working beneath all the articles assembled in the book.

The second assumption is the North-South divide. It is believed that the world of research is widely divided along the North and the South. Further, it is assumed that the tools of research have been devised in the social science academia of the North while these tools are made

use of both in the North and the South. The authors attempt to highlight the type of problems which emerge while applying these tools in the Southern regions. Before moving on, it would be wise to suggest that the North-South divide, as made in the book, may though be useful for the purpose at hand, but it is based on a generalization. One may not find it difficult to identify acute diversities within each region and hence the tools of research may be questioned even in the region of their origin. Moreover, it would be an under-estimation of the South if it is assumed that no tools of research were ever invented here. Modern social science may not have acknowledged this, but a little effort can bring into limelight the indigenous methods of enquiry, and local tools of research, as employed in the South, both in the past and in present.

Avoiding to comment on each article comprising the book, one can highlight the major observations, arguments and conclusions of these chapters. All these articles emphasize the contextuality of the research and address different issues, dilemmas and pitfalls in conducting research. These issues etc. have been highlighted through the narratives of the indigenous and local researchers apart from those who come from distant lands and do research in the Southern regions. A major issue discussed in the respective articles deals with the dichotomy of the tools and methodology of research evolved in the advanced countries on the one hand and the nature of the objects of research in the Southern regions, on the other. Here, the researcher is required to demonstrate a realization of local sensitivities. The authors suggests that reflexive approach may also be helpful in resolving this contradiction, whereby the researcher would need to re-think about his or her tools and apply them in a different setting of the South more creatively.

The article by Almina Pardhan discusses the East-West conflict and highlights the ethical dilemmas confronted by a researcher while doing research with young children in a Southern region. (Her study adopts Pakistan as the field of research). Emphasizing the need to evolve a code of ethics for the purpose of addressing the ethical issues. She holds that 'in order to ensure that children from diverse cultural and geographical setting are heard and respected in the research process, my research suggests the re-consideration of current conventional research ethics which assume an ethnocentric universality to one which creates space for contextually relevant ethical and moral codes of conduct' (p. 55). Here, one may suggest that while devising the ethical guidelines regarding the code of conduct, help may also be sought from the codes of conduct provided by established international research bodies, like the American Educational Research Association (AERA), and the British Educational Research Association (BERA). However, while doing so,

the researcher in a given Southern region should not fully depend on the codes of external organizations but should also benefit from the local cultural and moral norms and moral values.

The conflict between the ethical norms and rules framed in the West and the social and ethical environment of Pakistan is also discussed in the articles by Saiqa Imtiaz Asif and Rashida Qureshi. Asif narrates her experience of working in a Pakistani field and finding out how different the environment of her work was as compared to the neatly laid down ethical research codes prescribed by a British university where she was registered as a Ph.D student. She holds that for smooth conduct of research the codes of research should be evolved in the context of the place where the research is conducted. Qureshi's article emphasizes the fostering of research in a manner that international ethical standards are upheld and the specific socio-cultural requirements of the diverse research settings are also responded to.

Dilshad Ashraf gives a feminist perception of researching women's lives in Pakistan's mountainous regions. She narrates how during the course of a research she was faced with the issue of defining to herself her identity. While she was working as a researcher, the objects, that is, the women, considered her a sister. She resolved the methodological issue and the tension involved in it by taking a reflexive stance.

The other articles bring under discussion similar issues in the context of some other societies like those of Kenya and Mexico. All the articles of the book may also be discussed in a wider context of subaltern studies which focus the diverse objects – regions, communities, ethnic groups, etc. unattended so far by the historians. The book provides helpful clues to successful field research. It can be made use of by the students of research methodology and also the actual practitioners of research. Its publication is, therefore, quite commendable.

Pakistan Study Centre,
University of Karachi.

Syed Jaffar Ahmed

Tanvir Ahmad Tahir, *Political Dynamics of Sindh 1947-1977*, Karachi: Pakistan Study Centre, University of Karachi, 2010, pp.801, price Rs.800.

The book under review is based on the Ph. D. dissertation of the author. The book focuses on the dynamics of political development of Sindh before and after the emergence of Pakistan. The focal point of the study is to analyse the issues and events that emerged on the political horizon

of Pakistan in general and Sindh in particular during the period 1947-1977.

The author has consulted various primary and secondary sources to develop his argument. He has also collected significant data, through interviews, for the purpose to authenticate and elaborate his thesis. The book consists of ten chapters. Chapter one deals with the conceptual framework and the remaining nine chapters reflect historical analysis of the issues and events that emerged during the first four decades of the political history of Sindh. In social sciences, research, theoretical framework helps to simplify the complex socio-political phenomena by bringing them in sequence and giving them a comprehensible meaning and interpretation. Conceptual framework of the book is not based on a singular theoretical model instead, the author has adopted multidimensional approach to examine the political development of Sindh. For instance, he has tried to view political activities in Sindh with the help of conceptual model of 'ethnicity', Marxist paradigms of 'class struggle', 'relative deprivation theory' and the Hatcher's model of 'internal colonization'.

In a broader view, the author has rightly attempted to interpret political issues and events in the paradigms of 'ethnic identity' in general and particularly in the framework of 'unity' and 'diversity'. Elaborating his argument, he has successfully established that the stalemates and hiccups in our political system occurred when ever our political leadership refused to recognize the reality of plurality of Pakistani polity and, instead, tried to view Pakistan as a monolithic religious identity.

Historical analysis of the freedom movement of Pakistan reveals that 'the separatist demands of the Muslim League had to reckon with the existing ethnic diversities. Pakistani society has remained overwhelmingly Muslim but composed (of) distinct communities. However, after independence, the Muslim League leadership projected a concept of Pakistani nationhood wherein the state was equated with nation, and perceived ethnic diversities as counterpoised to the national integration'.

Borrowing the Marxist model to analyse the Sindhi ethnic movement, the author has attempted to look into the nationalist movement of Sindh as a 'part and form of class struggle' dominated by the 'aspirations' and 'interests' of Sindhi 'bourgeoisie'. Beside these models, the author has also applied the 'Relative Deprivation Theory' to portray the post independence political scenario of Sindh. Sindhis played a significant role in the establishment of Pakistan with the hopes for better future—in terms of economic prosperity, political emancipation and justifiable power sharing formula. In contrast, after the creation of

Pakistan the hopes and aspirations of the Sindhi population suffered a setback with a growing realization that they stand deprived and destitute as compared to the 'core groups'.

Hatcher's model of internal colonisation might be a suitable model for Sindhi nationalists to advocate their case for political and economic rights. According to this model, 'economic dependence of periphery is reinforced by the centre through judicial, political and military measures'. Maneuvering through institutional arrangements by the core groups has generated the sense of 'internal colonisation' and 'subjugation' among sub-national groups including Sindhis.

Despite the above cited models, the author has meticulously applied several other theoretical frameworks to examine and interpret the dynamics of the socio-economic and political developments in Sindh.

Under the title of 'Political awakening in Sindh and the Freedom Movement', the author has tried to figure out the geo-political significance of Sindh in the Indian subcontinent. Besides he has also given a brief historical account of Sindh's struggle to retain its political identity and geographical entity from the ancient to modern times. Further more, he has highlighted Sindh's struggle against the colonial rule focussing on the important event of the war of independence, Hur movement, the movement of separation of Sindh from Bombay, Khilafat movement and above all Sindh's role in the Pakistan movement.

Undoubtedly, Sindh played a significant role in the political and constitutional struggle for the creation of Pakistan. In 1938, Sindh Provincial Conference, in a resolution, advised the All India Muslim League leadership to embark on the political and constitutional endeavours aimed at carving 'a federation' for the Indian Muslims out of British India. In 1943, provincial legislative of Sindh passed an unprecedented resolution demanding the creation of 'independent national states' for the Indian Muslims. Later on, on 26 June 1947, in pursuance of the 3rd June plan of bifurcation of the British India in to two dominions, the provincial legislative of Sindh resolved to join the dominion of Pakistan.

However, the unfolding events of the early years of Pakistan became catalyst to generate feelings of betrayal and disenchantment among the 'progressive and nationalist elements' of Sindh who had joined the struggle for Pakistan on the basis of the commitments made in the Lahore Resolution which promised full-fledged provincial 'autonomy' bordering on 'sovereignty'. Contrary to that, after achieving the goal of separate homeland, 'the early leaders of the state tried to concentrate enormous powers within the centre at the cost of provinces'. The policy pursuits of the ruling elite of Pakistan aimed at promoting

Pakistani nationhood through executive authority and by mobilizing the state machinery, not only hampered the process of national integration but also alienated Sindhis and other ethnic identities of Pakistan from the body politics of Pakistan.

The oppressed people of Sindh participated in the struggle for Pakistan with the hopes for a better future but the post-independent events shattered their optimism. The most oppressed class of the Sindhian society—*haris* could not get justice in the newly created Muslim state of Pakistan. Their dreams of becoming the owners of the lands which they had been cultivating for generations turned into a nightmare when the lands, evacuated by the Hindu landlords, were allotted to the emigrants and ex-servicemen of the army instead. Sindhi *haris* could not get even those lands which they mortgaged to Hindu moneylenders. In this regard, Sindh Assembly passed Land Owners Mortgage Bill aimed at returning the mortgaged lands to their owners but the bill could not become a law because ‘the Sindh governor refused to sign (it) on the advice of the governor general’.

The Sindhi intelligentsia felt a sense of treachery when the central government decided to separate Karachi from Sindh (1948) and impose the One-Unit scheme (1955). Such decisions created strong ethnic sentiments among the Sindhis.

Despite the outcry of the Sindh Provincial Muslim League Assembly Party and a unanimous resolution of Sindh Provincial Assembly, the central government took over the administrative control of Karachi and its surroundings. The separation of Karachi injured the body politics of Sindh and caused economic sufferings. Karachi was the main source of revenue collection for the Sindh province. Its separation caused estimated financial loss of ‘Rs.600 to 800 millions to the Sindh government but the central government had offered a compensation of Rs. 6 million only, which was never paid’.

Another event that injured the popular feelings of the local population was the imposition of the one-unit scheme. In 1955, the central government, through political maneuvering and bickering, annulled the provincial status of Sindh and three other provinces of the western wing of Pakistan. The *raison d’être* of the one-unit scheme was three fold—to perpetuate Mohajir-Punjabi hegemony, to convert Bengali majority into minority, and freeze out the possibilities of the emergence of Bengali-Sindhi-Baloch-Pushtoon alliance against Punjabi-Mohajir nexus. As a consequence of the implementation of one-unit, Sindh lost its political identity and was absorbed into a newly created province of West Pakistan. These political moves not only generated a sense of alienation among the Sindhi masses but fortified the prevailing feelings

of 'internal colonization and subjugation' of Sindh to the non-Sindhi ruling elite.

During the Ayub era, Sindhi masses actively participated in the anti-one-unit movement along with the smaller provinces of West Pakistan. As the result of Ayub's policies, binary ethnic composition of ruling elite of Pakistan—Punjabi-Mohajir—was transformed into Mohajir-Punjabi-Pashtoon troika. This expansion of the core group further aggravated the sense of deprivation among the Sindhis. During the military rule of Ayub Khan, thousands acres of agricultural land of Sindh was allotted to the Punjabis and Pathans. Under the policy of industrialization of the country 'the small numbers of industries set up in the interior of Sindh were not only owned by the non-Sindhis but also manned by Punjabi or Pakhtoon labour'.

After the fall of Ayub regime, Yahya Khan took over as the second martial administrator of the country. The advent of Yahya regime proved beneficial for the smaller provinces of the western wing of Pakistan in general and for Sindh in particular. Yahya Khan's military regime abolished one-unit, fixed a quota for the rural Sindh in government jobs, printed electoral list in Sindhi language and re-merged Karachi with the Sindh province. During this period, on the one hand, Sindhi intelligentsia was 'divided into various factions' but the major chunk of Sindhi nationalists joined the populist movement of Pakistan Peoples' Party.

Bhutto's incumbency to power generated a sense of power sharing among the Sindhi elite. However, some nationalists portrayed Bhutto as a 'power hungry and self inflicted person' who compromised the interests of Sindhis to please the Punjabi-Mohajir ruling elite. On the other hand, non-Sindhi ethnic groups, living in Sindh, felt threatened by Bhutto's Sindhi identity consequently, they forged the Punjabi-Mohajir-Pathan front against his government. These ethnocentric determinants of the political mobilization shaped the future course of political development of Sindh.

To sum up, this book gives unprejudiced interpretation of the politics of ethnicity in Pakistan in general and Sindh in particular. The present ethnic unrest in Sindh, in fact, is the sequel to the flawed ethnic policies of the governing classes—core ethnic groups of Pakistan. The refusal, on the part of core ethnic groups, to recognize the multiethnic identity of Pakistan not only hindered the processes of national integration but also hampered the processes of 'socio-economic development, modernization and state-building' which ultimately led to the perpetual ethnic conflict in Pakistan.

Department of Pakistan Studies,
Allama Iqbal Open University,
Islamabad.

Aman Memon

***The Globalisation Bandwagon A 'Global South' Perspective*, by S.H. Zaidi,¹ published by the author, Karachi, 2009, pages: 412, price: Pak rupees 750, US \$ 30.**

Change has been a constant feature if one overviews the history of humanity on this planet. Its pace has varied, determined by forces not totally in the control of humans. However, gradually human control over such changes and their understanding kept on increased. The most recent label put on the process of social change is 'globalization'. This very label and concept has generated a series of debate which had not only challenged its validity but has promoted research on its threats/implications from various perspectives. The book under review has been written, as its title indicates, from the global south's perspectives, while the process of globalization has been initiated by the global north. It has meaning in different regions, classes and groups of nations different. It has been an intriguing concept as well, meaning blessing for some and bane for others. The incentive for the author to write this book has been 'to make sense of the contemporary world', so crucial for any one living in the 'developing' or the 'underdeveloped' world.

The book refers to and draws upon a number of debates in the political economy of change. It is highly informative as well as analytical. It is divided into five chapters, one good length introduction, and an epilogue. Glossary and notes are also useful for the new learners. Index is also very helpful.

The 'Introduction' itself is comprehensive. The prescription of the 'Global North' for the 'Global South' to jump on the bandwagon of globalization, in order to end their endemic poverty, is the main theme of the book. In the first chapter, the author indicates what is not mentioned in this prescription but is inevitably the cost, of benefiting a tiny minority of the upper classes in both the regions, which is paid by the victims of globalization in the form of famines, genocides, civil wars, social deprivation, and environmental degradation. He questions the validity and 'rightfulness' of the approaches projected through the current policies of neo-liberal globalization. Talking about a possible backlash to

¹ S.H. Zaidi is a researcher based in Karachi.

globalization, the author envisages a 'less secure world'. He advises to be aware of the adverse effects and then take remedial initiatives to check them.

The second chapter largely deals with the economic and political processes which historically have been at work to evolve what is known today as globalization. It presents a comprehensive overview of theoretical explanations offered by the classical political economy, Marx's analysis of capitalism, neo-classical economics, institutional economics, Keynesian economics, new classical economics, post Keynesian economics and neoliberalism. He logically brings this discussion to look into the utility and validity of such an understanding to comprehend the today's situation of supporting or opposing globalization. He highlights the reasons for opposing globalization. He also explains the performance and experience of Pakistan regarding adoption of policies of corporate globalization, which have resulted in a confused foreign policy and loss of sovereignty of the State in Pakistan.

The third chapter is focused upon the global reaction to the corporate globalization, mainly in the form of World Social Forum and other anti-globalizations movements. It carries the message that 'economics be subordinated to society, not society to economics'. The fourth chapter identifies the processes giving shape and strength to globalization, such as: information technology, transportation, economic crises, outsourcing, worldwide social and cultural movements and resultant creation of a network society. He criticizes the clever move of putting the label of 'global culture' to camouflage 'cultural imperialism' and excessive advertising to dwindle local market's capability to compete with global markets.

The weakening role of national governments in the wake of globalization is discussed in chapter five. Zaidi asserts that there is a general misconception that capitalist globalization would weaken the national governments, whereas the state, particularly a weak state, as an institution, is essential for capitalism to survive and flourish.

Apart from discussing the theoretical and contextual factors relevant to globalization in general, Zaidi also discusses the situation of Pakistan in particular throughout the book. He especially judges the performance of the ruling elite and the state machinery critically since this performance has been responsible for the general dismal state of affairs one finds Pakistan in, at the end of 2009. The author reviews the approaches of economic development adopted so far in Pakistan and suggests what may not sound new, but is very much right, pertinent and crucial for the today's planners and managers to attend to. He holds that:

Economic development requires proper planning, laying down the right priorities, establishing indigenous industry, and above all, encouraging creativity, innovation and hard work. *There is no shortcut.* It demands that we develop our human and physical resources and infrastructure, maintain and enhance our agricultural potential, and carry out mineral prospecting for hidden wealth. *Above all, it requires that the ruling elite overcome their acquisitive instincts, and curb their propensity to indulge in lavish and wasteful living.* The aim should be national self-reliance in basic factors in the shortest possible time. Loans must be used only to finance productive ventures, such as establishing basic industry and laying down essential infrastructure. (emphasis added). (p. 12)

Some more critical questions addressed by the book are related to the dependence of Pakistan's ruling elite on the 'so called 'friends' who facilitate the government to procure loans and make it fight 'their strategic wars'. The dynamics of 'aid', its implication in the form of growth of underdevelopment and militancy, and failure to bring enlightenment, are also discussed by him.

Some of the assertions by Zaidi can be referred here to show main thrust of his approach. He writes that: 'free trade is neither free nor fair'; and 'the competition regime is neither perfect nor fair'. He further asserts: 'There seems no alternative to capitalism at present. The sensible thing is to keep the ... capitalism, under control'. His major conclusion is that the real struggle is economic; but mass literacy and political and demographic change precede economic change. The public policy made by ruling elite and their handpicked planners have failed to turn people into an asset. The only sustainable way is to develop indigenous physical and human resources. With such an assertion one would find the author as highlighting the nexus between human capital development, and the challenges of development under the conditions of globalization.

The author has used a fairly balanced description, criticism and arguments in explaining an important topic of the contemporary world. While he starts from the Global South's Perspective', he is not any outrageous, or biased in the favour of 'South', as he also highlights the advantages or prospects opened by the globalization process for the southern countries. He assesses why the southern population would not resist it with full force if benefits are accruing to them mainly due to outsourcing. He has highlighted the alliance among the ruling classes of both the developed and developing countries and explains how anti-

globalization forces run the risk of being undermined due to the ‘infiltration of anti-people, and pro-corporatist elements in the movement’. The beneficiaries in Global South are no doubt going to approve such effects of globalization, but the author rightly points out that in the Global North, ‘Now it is the turn of the white collar workers to protest’. In this way he analyzes the class-dimension of the process as well to establish that in reality the capital has no morality; it goes where it can grow, regardless of the effect on the humans or natural environment. With this in mind, he holds that ‘free flow of capital and labour would naturally equalize the wage differences’, but he foresees a restriction on this probable equality, which would be imposed under any pretext by the guardians of capitalist globalization since they are not willing to allow the poor South to rise and be equal to the rich North. He also refers to the political effects of migration, since ‘people are resistant to aliens and because immigration creates social and political problems, [and] immigration from the poor countries is one of the reasons for the rise of extreme right factions in many Western countries’; and despite this the US economic ‘statistics alone makes a persuasive argument for more green cards’.

The book confirms the fact that both the concepts of globalization and anti-globalization, not separable in actuality but only hypothetically, are bereft with contradictions. The critics and analysts of these processes have to be cautious of the ‘slippery’ nature of the topic. S.H. Zaidi, however, has very efficiently dealt with this challenge.

Contextualizing Pakistan in the age of globalization, Zaidi points out the damage done by the attitude of the dominant elite. As a result of which, habit of dependence on external powers, aid, and banking system is established whereas the only beneficiary of the aid is the dominant elite. Economic inequality, control of the US, ‘a strong government and weak society’, and failure to form ‘strong enough nationalist bourgeoisie’, are some of its outcomes. Within Pakistan, he identifies three overlapping spheres – democratic, bureaucratic, and capitalist – since the State is capitalist and capitalist interests are intertwined with the bureaucratic machinery. The globalization process needs the State in the dominant countries, to fulfill its agenda of world domination, whereas the poor section everywhere in the world pins hope on the State as there exists no other entity to redress their problems, hence the State is not going to whither away.

Regarding the US driven militarism, Zaidi comments that it has been adopting self-defeating doctrines, such as the ‘doctrine of preemption’; this is a prescription for a perpetual war. Moreover, he calls the ‘war on terror’ as an open-ended war, having no end in sight.

Regarding gender issues, Zaidi holds that capitalism benefits from patriarchy, therefore it considers the domestic labour as unpaid labour, whereas it amounts to 50 per cent of total GDP in the US.

Zaidi finds inequalities and dynamics of gender, race, class and ethnicity, being of central concern in capitalism. Explaining interaction between gender and capitalism, he understands that the feminist movement has 'to target the prevailing structures and institutions of capital' in order to end gender discrimination. On the other hand, the author expects that capitalism and market economy have negative implications for racism, but in general, it cannot end inequalities through the market mechanism alone hence it depends on State to re-distribute income and social expenditures.

Regarding Pakistan, Zaidi sees a weak civil society and military appropriating resources for the welfare of its own members. Major political parties have no economic agenda as such, and the adoption of neo-liberal agenda under the pressure of IFIs, is encouraging the role of market and minimizing the role of the state in Pakistan.

The author has avidly analyzed various processes going on in the society, which have their roots in the past and present and have great implications for the future. To mention a few, these include militarism and terrorism and involvement of the state and society in the war on terror under compulsion, as well as incentive to please the US, before which the dominant elite has been bowing since the day of independence. He condemns the policy of Musharraf regime to support US 'war on terror' so overwhelmingly, since it brought to Pakistan the losses which the minuscule US aid cannot compensate. He meticulously analyses the way financial management of the country and why it is in trouble. The composition of elite class in Pakistan also reveals its inclination to overvalue capital, and undervalue labour. Due to the league among the powerful and influential (politicians and the bureaucracy), loot and plunder is on, and consequently, the onus of struggling to end inequality, tyranny and injustice has come to the intelligentsia and the middle class. He points out that the religious leadership has been used by the ruling class to promote the rulers' interests.

Zaidi has tried to diagnose the problems, to suggest solutions and also to identify those who are responsible for creating this quagmire of underdevelopment. One reason other than lack of political will and economic weakness is mental and intellectual lethargy. Truly, this is something which needs a lot more emphasis. Regarding the insurgent Taliban, he finds the government's policy as indecisive as well as 'dual' to fight with them and to keep them alive as well. He decries the 'tacit agreement' about the drone attacks on Pakistan according to which

Pakistan is only to protest and that is all, while the primary responsibility of protecting people lies on the government of the day. Zaidi has also discussed issues related to democracy and modernization.

This book would surely be useful for the ordinary Pakistanis due to its simple language, explanatory style and extensive use of available sources. It is not complicated in its approach, style and presentation. Certainly minor editorial and typographical mistakes need to be corrected to avoid confusion. There are few books available on the theme of political economy of globalization from this perspective, and this book would be a good addition to the stock of knowledge, especially in that it is written with an original approach keeping in view the host of factoring at work in the contemporary Pakistan. Undoubtedly the strongest reason to write this book has been an urge to see Pakistan growing as a prosperous and dignified nation. This scholarly contribution could not have been made without such vision and passion.

Pakistan Study Centre
University of Karachi.

Anwar Shaheen

***The Quran: The Book Free of Doubt –Exploratory Essays into I'jaz al-Quran and Other Topics* by Syed Munir Wasti, Gujrat: University of Gujrat Press, 2009**

It has become increasingly rare for Pakistani scholars to engage in a serious discussion outside their disciplinary walls. The likes of Muhammad Hasan Askari and Karrar Hussain (who were both professors of English but regularly roved outside the literary precincts) belonged to another age in which scholarly breadth was often read as a sign of intellectual robustness. Now, despite the advantages of technology, few teachers venture to write on topics beyond their ever shrinking pale of specialization.

In this dry-ink atmosphere, Syed Munir Wasti's assortment of 'exploratory essays into *Ijaz al-Quran* and other topics' published under the title *The Quran: the Book Free of Doubt* by the University of Gujrat Press comes as a welcome surprise. Professor Wasti who has twice chaired the Department of English, University of Karachi, has re-charged the memory of illustrious Pakistani men of letters whose voice was frequently heard outside their own professional corridors. However on a more personal note the choice of the subject of the book is hardly surprising for the author. A fourth-generation English professor, Dr Wasti has chosen a subject that would surely bring comfort to his

forbears in their graves. His father, grandfather and even his great-grandfather were dedicated scholars of English studies. Interestingly all of them wrote extensively on Islamic subjects. Professor Syed Abdul Ghani, the author's grandfather, had rendered Sheikh Sa'adi Shirazi's *Karima* into English while the author's father Professor Syed Jamiluddin Wasti delved into the challenges posed by modernity for practicing Muslim communities in his book *Islami Riwayaat*. It is therefore not all that curious that Professor Munir Wasti should have published the volume under consideration. An intellectual taste for Islamic studies flows in his blood.

Divided into four sections titled respectively the 'Quran text', 'grammar', '*Ijaz al-Quran*' and 'general', this relatively short work contains almost a hundred chapters of varying length. The book is replete with references to Urdu, English and Arabic works, classical as well as modern. The writer showcases an impressive range of accomplished scholars alongside some not-so-accomplished aspirants throughout the book which amply reflects his wide reading. For anyone wishing to acquaint himself with some of the central issues in the history of Quranic studies, *Exploratory Essays* should serve as a good primer. The short essays compiled here are obviously disparate pieces; hence there is no overarching thesis to bind them. The busy reader may pick the book from anywhere and take in as much as he or she can before being distracted by mundane demands. This self-contained pointedness that characterizes all the pieces may appeal especially to those suffering from 'interruptitus' but this conciseness seems to have a thwarting effect on the momentum of the essays. The snippets such as the 'Names of surahs', 'Mushkilat al Quran' and 'The use of the mutlaq and the muqayyad' touch on crucial topics but each of them is wrapped up in half a page leaving the reader thirsting for an expanded treatment. For some reason, on most occasions the writer stops short of developing a sustained argument. If there is any progression in the book, it is loosely thematic and internal to each section.

Then there are pieces that have an encyclopedic usefulness. The two separate write-ups on the flora and fauna cited in the Quran list the animals and plants mentioned in the Book. There are actually several entries of this kind such as the one on the variant 'readings' (recitation styles) of the Quran, and on the *Huruf al-shamsiyya wa al-qamariyya* (Sun- and moon-letters) of the Arabic alphabet.

One of those infrequent occasions when Prof. Wasti deals with a topic at some length occurs in an informative essay on the 'Aspects of Quran translation'. He grapples with the purported objections to Quranic

translation and examines the historical causes for the beliefs surrounding the untranslatability of revelation.

A piquant series of essays that should rather have been worked into a consolidated treatise addresses the issue of textual corruption (*tahrif*). Wasti squarely rebuts the marginal voices that have from time to time doubted the inviolability of the Quran. It would have lent further value to the essay had the researcher documented how the Orientalists sometimes sourced their opinions to fringe Muslim voices.

Another noteworthy essay is the early piece on the history of the Quranic text which presents the critical milestones in the compilation of the sacred scripture. This is a promising starter and it also serves as a preview to the rest of the book. The narrative builds up steadily but then the essay takes a sudden, descriptive turn. The details are doubtless integral to the history of the Book but their inclusion here seems to have a halting effect on the flow of the essay.

The book contains many semi-biographical book reviews particularly in the section on 'I'jaz al-Quran'. These are biographical to the extent that they profile the contributors to Quranic studies in terms of their scholarly background and religious orientation. The astonishing diversity of these scholars ranging from classical authorities such as al-Baqillani, al-Qurtabi and Shah Waliullah to Muslim modernists such as Ismail R. Faruqi and Mohammed Arkoun and Orientalists such as Arthur Jeffery and John Wansbrough evokes mixed feelings. Prof. Wasti is fond of reserving an independent point of view on most topics and feels no qualms in throwing down the gauntlet at scholarly deliberations.

The book closes with a detailed bibliography that students and scholars of comparative Quranic studies will surely find helpful. The works consulted or cited by the author are arranged under separate thematic and linguistic heads. An index of proper names is also included.

Despite the glitches, the book merits attention for engaging a range of questions surrounding Quranic textual studies. As a conversation-starter, Wasti's book is bound to spark some heat on a number of controversial topics it touches. The University of Gujrat Press has gone an extra mile in embellishing the physical layout of the book. Its attractive title, the creamy art paper and a round- spine binding make it an attractive feast for the book collector.

Department of English,
University of Karachi.

Tayyab Zaidi

***Empires of the Indus: The Story of a River* by Alice Albinia, London: John Murray, 2009, pp.366, price £9.99.**

Writing about Indian history, Alice found that everywhere she turned the Indus was there.

Ever since Homosapiens first migrated out of Africa, the Indus has drawn thirsty conquerors to its banks. Some of the worlds first cities were built here; India's earliest Sanskrit literature was written about the river; Islam's holy preachers wandered beside these waters. Pakistan is only the most recent of Indus valley's political avatars (p.xv).

She recounts:

Its merchants traded with Mesopotamia five thousand years ago. A Persian emperor mapped it in the sixth century BCE, the Buddha lived beside it during previous incarnation, Greek kings and Afghan sultans waded across it with their armies. The founder of Sikhism was enlightened while bathing in a tributary. And the British invaded it by gunboat, colonized it for over one hundred years, and then severed it into two (p.xv).

The book reiterates facts of common interest like the very name of India is derived from the river. In ancient Sanskrit it is called Sindhu, changed by the Persians to 'Hindu'; and the Greeks dropped the 'h' altogether. Chinese whispers created the Indus and its cognates—India, Hindu, Indies. (p.xvi). The river itself has had many names—Purali meaning capricious in Sindhi, 'Abbasin [Father of Rivers] it is to the Pathans, the Baltis also call it 'Gemtsuh' or the great head 'Tsu-fo' [the Male River] and at its source in Tibet it is 'Senge Tsampo' [the Lion River] (p.xvii).

The book is a narrative of a journey along the Indus, 'upstream and back in time from the sea to its source, from the moment Pakistan came into being in Karachi, to the time millions of years ago in Tibet, where the river itself was born'. This river is in the heart of the book for it runs through the lives of the people along its banks like a charm, '...honoured by poets and the common folk, more than any politician, ruler or priest. And sadly it --the king of rivers, the 'Lion' is a diminished river today, having been heavily dammed by the British colonialists in the early part of the twentieth century in pursuit of devouring the fertile lower Indus valley and extending through sixty years of army-dominated rule' (p.xvi).

The Indus, born in the wake of Kangri Ranpoche some thirty to forty- five million years ago, is the oldest in the region. Clouds blew in from the sea, snagged on the mountains, and fell forming glaciers. In

summers with the melting of these glaciers, the water flowed westwards' creating the river, originating in Tibet and ending in one of the worlds largest deep sea fans in the delta off the Arabian Sea. The Indus nurtured many saints. Guru Nanak was enlightened while immersed in its waters. The origins of Sikhism, its gurus and subsequent growth into a formal religion makes interesting reading. The foundation stone of the holiest temple – The Golden temple – was laid by a Muslim!

While writing about the Indus, the author has also researched the various empires along its banks throughout history. As with the Indus, she has done a comprehensive study and comes up with a detailed , relevant account of the people who lived there, the different dynasties who ruled the land, those who came to invade it, those who left or were repulsed and those who stooped to conquer it.

Albinia describes, after scholarly research on the fields along the banks of the Indus, from Tibet to Sindh, the different periods of history, geography, culture and civilization which are the legacy of the river and those who belong to it. The eras, which make the history of the land of the Indus, are well documented. From the first migration out of Africa around 80,000 years ago of the homo sapiens and forty thousand years later when humans crossed the mighty Indus going north to Tibet into central Asia, eastwards to central and southern India, the panorama of events unfolds as you go from chapter to chapter. Her account of Alexander's invasion is singular for it also shows her search for the roots of the empires of the Indus and her grit in following the trail from the point where he entered into what is today Pakistan's border.....on foot as he did!!

To see the Indus where it offers itself to the Arabian Sea, she hires a boatman, 'I ask him to ferry me from Karachi [the old Indus delta,where Pakistan began] along the mangroves coast, and up the river to Thatta [the major port in the region until British times]'. (p.26). The book describes the Sheedis in detail, After her encounter with them in Thatta, she delves into their history and roots in Africa. Information about them, scarce as it is even in Sindh, is revealing as detailed by the author.Their culture, music and language is recorded after painstaking research which takes her upto a remote village,Tando Bago. It is interesting that this ethnic group, sidelined by the mainstream Sindhis, also holds the revolutionary Sufi, poet, statesman and warrior, Shah Inayet, as its hero along with many other devotees of this radical saint.Hosh Mohammad Sheedi, the brave general who fought with the Talpurs against the Britishers, was a Sheedi.

The British conquest of Sindh is described in detail from the early attempts by the East India company to the invasion by Charles

Napier in 1842. It is a matter of pride for Sindh that, even after the writ of regal England was established over most of India, resistance was given to it in Sindh which was the last to give way to the colonial thrust. It is interesting to note the mindset of the then leading European imperial power: 'Sir John Hobhouse gave a patriotic speech in which he extolled the army's bold and brilliant achievement of bringing civilization to the banks of the Indus---first time since the great Alexander marched his army down the river'. (p.42). A mindset which persists till today of the dominating powers vis a vis the third world which is rich with its own culture and history and abundance of natural resources as this book also reveals.

Just as her documentation of the end of the river into the Arabian Sea, made her go to Karachi and then, skirting the coastline of Pakistan, in an old rickety boat, she entered the delta and then Sindh, in her determination to see the source, she walked up into the Himalayas' in extreme cold weather, hail and snow. '...there are three rivers to cross on the way to the source.....here, however, the rivers are too wide to jump'. (p.306). Taking off their shoes, Alice and her guides step into the ice cold water, so cold '...it brings tears to my eyes and the water of the second river reaches my thighs. I look down at my feet moving across the river bed, across pebbles the colour of the gorges we have walked through: sky blue, tsampa pink, turmeric yellow'. The search is about to end, she moves on eagerly.

We walk quickly onwards. Suddenly, we come upon the source. 'there it is' says Karma, pointing to a long low line of chortens [Tibetan stupas] in the distance and a mass of prayer flags, pushing taut in the wind....we follow the stream up to the top of this gentle hill and there it ends, in a pale rock face at the foot of which water bubbles up from the mossy earth. This is the Senge Khabab—the Lion. 'This is the lions mouth' says Karma pointing to the rock face'.

The Gandhara civilization and the advent and growth of Buddhism is documented as she forays into Swat, Taxilla and the Silk highway. An interesting observation is the nexus she draws between Buddhism, Shias and the Taliban Islam. Two different faiths once were together along the banks of the Indus. Today, one can discern the influence of one over the other. In Baniyan, after Islam came in the region, the monumental Buddhas were absorbed into 'Shiite popular religious folklore'.

The Indus has the distinction in history of having the first planned cities of the world. An 'entire empire had been built here from the river's alluvium'. (p.243). From the mud of the Indus, bricks were

molded and used in the construction of the cities of the Indus Valley Civilization, a practice which has passed through centuries to the present era. This remarkable civilization was discovered in 1922, transforming the understanding of Indian history and perhaps of the world. In the chapter, *Alluvial Cities*, the author has given details of the cities along the Indus since time immemorial.

Each of the hundreds of towns and cities along the banks of the river were identical, as if the Indus Valley Civilization was conceptualized, planned and constructed according to one model... This was no immigrant invaders' culture; it was of the soil. At a time when the forebears of their colonial masters were still using stone tools, the citizens of the Indus valley were enjoying a life of high urban sophistication. (pp.243).

This was not lost on Indian freedom fighters. Jawaharlal Nehru made a 'pilgrimage' to Mohen jo daro and in tribute to it wrote in his memoirs, penned down in a British colonial jail, 'that vision of five thousand years gave me a new perspective, and the burden of present seemed to grow lighter'. (p.244).

The Indus Valley Civilization splendor is in the concept of public good and their welfare. She says:

...unlike Egypt with its pyramids, or Mesopotamia with its temples, their biggest structures were not symbols of monarchical tyranny or priestly power, but civic buildings such as public baths and grain stores. Cities with public dustbins, indoor toilets and covered drains. Neat and tidy this utilitarian city, devoid of any semblance of ornament, was hailed as a Fabian utopia (p.244).

It is not clear who controlled it. In a telling conclusion she says 'according to historians. It was a socialist system, ruled neither by one dynastic despot not, as in Pakistan, by the tyranny of an army, but by a democracy of civic bodies' (p.245).

This story of the majestic, mighty, magnificent and mystifying Indus and the 'empires' along its banks through the various eras is a gripping narration based on painstaking travails and laden with information and new insights into our heritage and history.